

416 Using the definition of Exercise 415, but ignoring time, prove

(a) **do** P **while** b **od** = P . **while** b **do** P **od**

(b) **while** b **do** P **od** = **if** b **then** **do** P **while** b **od** **else** ok **fi**

(c) $(\forall \sigma, \sigma'. D = \text{do } P \text{ while } b \text{ od}) \wedge (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. W = \text{while } b \text{ do } P \text{ od})$
= $(\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (D = P. W)) \wedge (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. W = \text{if } b \text{ then } D \text{ else } ok \text{ fi})$

After trying the question, scroll down to the solution.

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{(a)} && \mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od} = P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \\
& \S && \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od}) \quad \text{reflexive and identity} \\
& = && (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od}) \\
& \Rightarrow && \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od})) \text{ use } \mathbf{while} \text{ construction} \\
& \Leftarrow && (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (P. \mathbf{ if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ } P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi} \Leftarrow P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od}) \\
& \Rightarrow && \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od})) \\
& && \text{let } D = (P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od}) \\
& = && (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (P. \mathbf{ if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ } D \mathbf{ else\ ok\ fi} \Leftarrow D) \\
& \Rightarrow && \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow D)) \quad \mathbf{do} \text{ induction axiom} \\
& = && \top
\end{aligned}$$

That's half of what we want. For the other half,

$$\begin{aligned}
& \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow \mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od}) \quad \text{Use } \mathbf{do} \text{ construction} \\
& \Leftarrow \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow P. \mathbf{ if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \\
& \quad \text{sequential composition is monotonic} \\
& \Leftarrow \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \\
& \quad \text{reflexive and identity and use } \mathbf{do} \text{ construction} \\
& = (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi} \\
& \quad \Leftarrow \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \\
& \Rightarrow \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi})) \\
& \Leftarrow (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ } P. \mathbf{ if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi\ else\ ok\ fi} \\
& \quad \Leftarrow \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \\
& \Rightarrow \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi})) \\
& \quad \text{let } W = (\mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \\
& = (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ } P. W \mathbf{ else\ ok\ fi} \Leftarrow W) \\
& \Rightarrow \forall \sigma, \sigma'. (\mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} \Leftarrow W)) \quad \mathbf{while} \text{ induction axiom} \\
& = \top
\end{aligned}$$

which is the other half of what we want.

An almost identical proof can be made from fixed-point axioms.

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{(b)} && \mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} = \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi} \\
& \S && (\mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} = \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \quad \text{use part (a)} \\
& = && (\mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od} = \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ } P. \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od\ else\ ok\ fi}) \\
& && \mathbf{while} \text{ fixed-point construction} \\
& = && \top
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{(c)} && (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. D = \mathbf{do\ } P \mathbf{ while\ } b \mathbf{ od}) \wedge (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. W = \mathbf{while\ } b \mathbf{ do\ } P \mathbf{ od}) \\
& = && (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. (D = P. W)) \wedge (\forall \sigma, \sigma'. W = \mathbf{if\ } b \mathbf{ then\ } D \mathbf{ else\ ok\ fi})
\end{aligned}$$