

126 A specification is transitive if, for all states  $a$ ,  $b$ , and  $c$ , if it allows the state to change from  $a$  to  $b$ , and it allows the state to change from  $b$  to  $c$ , then it allows the state to change from  $a$  to  $c$ . Prove  $S$  is transitive if and only if  $S$  is refined by  $(S.S)$ .

After trying the question, scroll down to the solution.

§ Let's begin with “ $S$  is refined by  $S.S$ ”.

$\forall \sigma, \sigma'. S \Leftarrow (S.S)$  use definition of sequential composition

$\equiv \forall \sigma, \sigma'. S \Leftarrow \exists \sigma''. \langle \sigma'. S \rangle \sigma'' \wedge \langle \sigma. S \rangle \sigma''$  antidistributive law

$\equiv \forall \sigma, \sigma'. \forall \sigma''. S \Leftarrow \langle \sigma'. S \rangle \sigma'' \wedge \langle \sigma. S \rangle \sigma''$   
reorder quantifiers (commutative law) and turn implication around (mirror law)

$\equiv \forall \sigma, \sigma'', \sigma'. \langle \sigma'. S \rangle \sigma'' \wedge \langle \sigma. S \rangle \sigma'' \Rightarrow S$  renaming

$\equiv \forall a, b, c. \langle \sigma, \sigma'. S \rangle a b \wedge \langle \sigma, \sigma'. S \rangle b c \Rightarrow \langle \sigma, \sigma'. S \rangle a c$