

Prove or disprove each of the following statements. Write detailed proof structures and justify your work.

1. For all real numbers  $r, s$ , if  $r$  and  $s$  are both positive, then  $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r+s}$ .

FIRST, write the statement symbolically:

$$\forall r \in \mathbb{R}, \forall s \in \mathbb{R}, r > 0 \wedge s > 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r+s}$$

SECOND, try a direct proof:

Assume  $r \in \mathbb{R}$  and  $s \in \mathbb{R}$

Assume  $r > 0$  and  $s > 0$

Then,  $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \dots$  NO OBVIOUS WAY TO CONTINUE.

NEXT, try an indirect proof:

Assume  $r \in \mathbb{R}$  and  $s \in \mathbb{R}$ .

Assume  $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \sqrt{r+s}$ .

Then,  $(\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s})^2 = (\sqrt{r+s})^2$ . # square both sides

Then,  $(\sqrt{r})^2 + 2\sqrt{r}\sqrt{s} + (\sqrt{s})^2 = r + s$ . # expand both sides

Then,  $2\sqrt{rs} = 0$ . # subtract  $r + s$  from both sides

Then,  $rs = 0$ . # divide by 2 and square both sides

Then,  $r = 0 \vee s = 0$ .

# NOW, DO A SUB-PROOF BY CASES.

Assume  $r = 0$ .

Then,  $r \neq 0$ .

Then,  $r \neq 0 \vee s \neq 0$ .

Then,  $\neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$ .

Assume  $s = 0$ .

Then,  $s \neq 0$ .

Then,  $r \neq 0 \vee s \neq 0$ .

Then,  $\neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$ .

In either case,  $\neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$ .

Then,  $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \sqrt{r+s} \Rightarrow \neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$

Then,  $r > 0 \wedge s > 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r+s}$ .

Then,  $\forall r \in \mathbb{R}, \forall s \in \mathbb{R}, r > 0 \wedge s > 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r+s}$ .

2. For all real numbers  $x$  and  $y$ ,  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$  exactly when  $x = \pm y$ .

FIRST, write the statement symbolically (be careful to handle that “ $\pm$ ” correctly):

$$\forall x \in \mathbb{R}, \forall y \in \mathbb{R}, x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Leftrightarrow (x = y \vee x = -y)$$

SECOND, start the proof structure for the universal quantifiers:

Assume  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  and  $y \in \mathbb{R}$ .

# TO PROVE AN EQUIVALENCE, WE PROVE THE IMPLICATION IN EACH DIRECTION.

First assume  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$ .

Then,  $x^3(x + y) - y^3(x + y) = 0$ . # factor out the expression

Then,  $(x^3 - y^3)(x + y) = 0$ . # factor out the expression

Then,  $x^3 - y^3 = 0 \vee x + y = 0$ . #  $ab = 0 \Leftrightarrow a = 0 \vee b = 0$

# NOW, DO A SUB-PROOF BY CASES.

Assume  $x^3 - y^3 = 0$

Then,  $x^3 = y^3$  # add  $y^3$  to both sides

Then,  $x = y$  # take cube roots on both sides, cube root is one-to-one so we can do it

Then,  $x = y \vee x = -y$  # introduce  $\vee$

Assume  $x + y = 0$

Then,  $x = -y$  # subtract  $y$  from both sides

Then,  $x = y \vee x = -y$  # introduce  $\vee$

In either case,  $x = y \vee x = -y$ .

Then,  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Rightarrow x = \pm y$ .

Next assume  $x = \pm y$ .

Then,  $x = y \vee x = -y$ . # expand “ $\pm$ ”

# NOW, DO A SUB-PROOF BY CASES.

Assume  $x = y$ .

Then,  $x^3 = y^3$ . # cube both sides

Then,  $x^3 - y^3 = 0$ . # subtract  $y^3$  from both sides

Then,  $(x^3 - y^3)(x + y) = 0$ . # multiply both sides by  $(x + y)$

Then,  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$ . # expand

Assume  $x = -y$ .

Then,  $x + y = 0$ . # add  $y$  to both sides

Then,  $(x^3 - y^3)(x + y) = 0$ . # multiply both sides by  $(x^3 - y^3)$

Then,  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$ . # expand

In both cases,  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$ .

Then,  $x = \pm y \Rightarrow x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$ .

Then,  $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Leftrightarrow x = \pm y$ . # introduce  $\Leftrightarrow$

Then,  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}, \forall y \in \mathbb{R}, x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Leftrightarrow (x = y \vee x = -y)$ .

Notice how the detailed proof structure makes it easy to keep track of assumptions, and cases and sub-cases, and to know exactly when we are done.