CSC 311: Introduction to Machine Learning Embedded Ethics — Recommender System Objectives

Roger Grosse Steven Coyne

University of Toronto, Fall 2021



- Today's lecture is part of the pilot of our new Embedded Ethics initiative.
- Topic: objective functions for recommender systems
- Two parts
 - ▶ Part 1 (Roger): technical challenges in moving beyond regression and classification
 - ▶ Part 2 (Steve): ethical challenges, and philosophical tools for reasoning about them

Recap and Motivation

Recap: Netflix Challenge

• Last lecture, we viewed collaborative filtering as a matrix completion problem.



- Our focus was on the learning algorithm.
- But this is just one component of a larger system. It's at least as imporant to consider the data and the objective function.

Recommender Systems



- Other kinds of recommendation systems include search engines and social media feeds.
- What are some difficulties you'd run into if you tried to use a Netflix-style algorithm to organize a user's social media feed?

Recommender Systems

• If you were designing an ML algorithm to organize a user's social media feed, what other information might you use?

• As a supervised learning problem, what would be the inputs, and what would be the targets?

• Google News was an early example of training a model to predict clicks.

● Not stories Und T computer science grads reflect on their studies - and the ports inspired them. Notepart 1 - Am 32 Image: Stories and Stories	=	Google News	Q, toronto computer science	×	٣	III 🜘
Image: Propulation of the propulation	•	Top stories	U of T computer science grads reflect on their studies – and the profs			University of Toronto Computer
 Rowsy boxcase Swed searches Swed searches CovLo #9 CovLo #9	ů	For you	who inspired them News@UofT - Jun. 24	A Star		Science Topic
Reversificances Seversifies S	슙	Following				* Follow
Saved searches The Solveen-old problem that eludes theoretical computer science Mit Treenelogy Heres - 04.37 Conda Conda Work Work Work Water Namesulation Tabelings Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Vesterery		News Showcase				
○ CoVID-19	Q	Saved searches	The 50-year-old problem that eludes theoretical computer science $\ensuremath{MIT}\xspace$ rechnology Review - Oct. 27	+ 4.4		
R Canada Global research alliance between U of T and University of Melboure to take strong relationship to another level" Wind Numegular 1 - out. 38 Vint local news Image and the strong relationship to another level" Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image another strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image another strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image another strong relationship to another level Image and the strong relationship to another level Image another strong relationship to another level Image another strong relationship to another strong relationship to another strong relationship to anot	۲	COVID-19		-		
Nund Lake Strong relationship to another fevel* Visual Control Numesplit(** - out. 3) Numesplit(** - out. 3) Numesplit(** - out. 3) Numesplit(** - out. 2) Numesplit(** - out. 3) Numesplit(** - out. 2) Numesplit(** - out. 3) Numesplit(** - out. 3) Numesplit(** - out. 3) Out the Nord step (**) Numesplit(** - out. 3)	p.	Canada	Global research alliance between U of T and University of Melbourne to			
v Tour local news Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchips: Professor wins top science award Image: Compare Single light in microchipscip science award </td <td>\odot</td> <td>World</td> <td>take 'strong relationship to another level' News@UofT - Oct. 28</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	\odot	World	take 'strong relationship to another level' News@UofT - Oct. 28			
Balanss Tapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award C Tachnology C Tabens - Vestadory Balanss C	9	Your local news		AMAGEN		
Image: Constraining in the image of the set of th	E	Business				
Image: Interviewed Image: Im	۲	Technology	Trapping light in microchips: Professor wins top science award CTV News - Yesterday	IL PLA		
Source U of T releases new guidelines for researchers engaging in international partnerships Yeatin Vensgluif - ost zi Larguage & region region settings U of T researchers create mirror-image peptides that can neutralize SARS-coV-2. Get the Android app [2] Vensgluif - ost zi Get the IOS sep [2] Source		Entertainment				
Solarizadi Uof Treleases new guidelines for researchers engaging in international partmerships partmerships (Searchers engaging in international Searchers engaging in international partmerships (Searchers engaging in international partmerships (Searchers engaging in international partmerships (Searchers engaging in international Searchers engaging in internatinal Searchers engaging in internat	ేం	Sports				
Fundsh Partmerships Newsgluff - otr. 23 Language Aregion Settings Uof T researchers create mirror-image peptides that can neutralize SARS-coV2 terrespirit - otr. 26 Get the Android app [2] Terrespirit - otr. 26 Get the IoN sep [2] Terrespirit	×	Science	U of T releases new guidelines for researchers engaging in international			
Language Snegon Begina (Snegon Settings Get the Android app 2 Get the Indication of the Snego 2 Get the Snego 2	К,	Health	partnerships NewwsgUoff - Oct. 21			
Settings: U of T researchers create mirror-image peptides that can neutralize SAR8-CoV-2 SAR8-CoV-2 Neuroplium - oct 26 Cet the IOS app ② Settings	Lanç Engli	uage & region Ih (Canada)				
Get the Android app [2] SARS-CoV-2 Newsjüller - Cet 26 Get the IOS app [2] Section - Cet 26	Setti	ngs	U of T researchers create mirror-image peptides that can neutralize			
Get the iOS app 🗹 Screenshot	Get	the Android app	SARS-CoV-2 NewsigilioTT - Oct. 26			
	Get	the iOS app 🛛	Screenshot			

9/24

• Why are clicks a useful signal?

• What are some problems with optimizing for clicks?

- Here is a Bayesian network designed to model user behavior for a search engine.
 - ▶ We covered Bayes nets briefly when we discussed na ive Bayes. They're covered in much more detail in CSC412.
- Nodes represent random variables, and edges represent direct influences. Shaded = observed.
- Want to infer user satisfaction (S).



Chuklin et al., "Click models for web search"

Intro ML (UofT)

- User preferences aren't just a matter of reactions to individual items, but also of the user's overall experience.
- Many web services optimize for a criterion called engagement.
 - User's frequency, intensity, or depth of interaction with a product over some time period
 - Not a technical term, but a business term, instantiated in different ways by different companies
 - E.g. Gmail: percentage of active users who visited the site on 5 or more days during the past week Rodden et al., "Measuring the user experience on a large scale"
 - E.g. Facebook: time spent on site, meaningful social interactions https://www.washingtonpost.com/technology/interactive/2021/how-facebook-algorithm-works/
- This is not directly optimized by an ML algorithm (as far as I know), but is used to evaluate changes to the system.
 - Sort of analogous to how logistic regression minimizes cross-entropy loss but you might tune hyperparameters based on accuracy.

- The choice of what to optimize for can have ethical implications (the subject of Steve's lecture)
- The recently published Facebook Papers reveal a lot about unintended consequences of algorithm design
 - ▶ My aim isn't to pick on Facebook here. They found these harms and worked to fix them!
- Early years: optimizing for likes and clicks \Rightarrow clickbait
- Optimizing for time spent reading/watching ⇒ favored professional over organic content
- 2017: service changed to reward comments & emojis ⇒ most successful political posts were the polarizing ones
 - Some political parties consciously shifted their messaging to be much more negative
 - ▶ Facebook eventually rolled back this change for health and politics
- https://www.wsj.com/articles/facebook-algorithm-change-zuckerberg-11631654215

Challenge 2: Bandit Feedback

Challenge 2: Bandit Feedback

- You only get information about user preferences for the posts you choose to show them. Therefore, the choices you make affect the data you get.
- This is closely related to the multi-armed bandit problem.



- You have a set of slot machine arms, and each arm i pays off \$1 with an unknown probability p_i .
- You are given T trials. You only find out the payoff for the arm that you tried. You want to maximize your total expected payoff.
- Showing the user a post = pulling an arm. Your metric (e.g. likes, clicks) = the payoff.

Here are the payoffs so far. Which arm should you pull next?

Arm 1: \$ \$ x \$ x \$ \$ x \$ \$ x \$ \$ Arm 2: x x x x \$ \$ x x x Arm 3: x \$

- Bandit problems are an important example of an exploration-exploitation tradeoff
 - "Exploitation": show the user a post you're confident they'll like
 - "Exploration": show the user a post they may or may not like so that you get information about their preferences
- We'll discuss approaches to the exploration-explotation tradeoff in our lecture on reinforcement learning.

- Most of this class has focused on classification, where there is a natural metric to use (accuracy).
- In this case, we'd like to produce a feed (an ordered list of items). Problems where we want to predict a structured object are known as structured prediction.
- For now, assume that all items are either relevant or irrelevant.
- Which of the following lists is preferable?





- One basic measure is precision: the fraction of items which are relevant.
- Which of the following lists is preferable?



- Precision@K: Precision for the list up to the *K*th item.
- Average Precision (AP): average of Precision@K, where K is taken as the indices of the first N relevant items.
 - ▶ Moving a relevant item from position 2 to position 1 is worth more points than moving it from position 8 to position 7.
- Mean Average Precision (MAP): mean of the AP over multiple queries.
- Note: in different application areas, there are different (but related) definitions of AP/MAP.

An example of calculating AP with N = 3.



What other factors might you consider in evaluating a list of recommendations?

- We've been discussing challenges that arise when defining optimization objectives beyond the basic classification and regression settings.
- So far, we've focused on challenges of building a useful and engaging system.
- But what we choose to optimize for can have unintended consequences. The rest of the lecture focuses on thinking about optimization objectives from an ethical standpoint.