

X3.0 (duality) Prove the duality laws on page 241:

$$\neg \forall v. b = \exists v. \neg b$$

$$\neg \exists v. b = \forall v. \neg b$$

from the quantifier axioms on page 240:

$$(0) \quad \forall v: \text{null}. b = \top$$

$$(1) \quad \forall v: x. b = \langle v: x. b \rangle x$$

$$(2) \quad \forall v: A, B. b = (\forall v: A. b) \wedge (\forall v: B. b)$$

$$(3) \quad \forall v: (\S v: D. b). c = \forall v: D. b \Rightarrow c$$

$$(4) \quad \exists v: \text{null}. b = \perp$$

$$(5) \quad \exists v: x. b = \langle v: x. b \rangle x$$

$$(6) \quad \exists v: A, B. b = (\exists v: A. b) \vee (\exists v: B. b)$$

$$(7) \quad \exists v: (\S v: D. b). c = \exists v: D. b \wedge c$$

After trying the question, scroll down to the solution.

§

I'll prove

$$\neg \forall v: D \cdot b = \exists v: D \cdot \neg b$$

by structural induction on the structure of the domain D . The ways of forming a domain are: $D = \text{null}$, $D = x$ (an element), $D = A, B$ (a union), and $D = \S v: E \cdot c$ (a comprehension). A domain formed as an intersection can also be formed in another way.

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: \text{null} \cdot b && \text{use (0)} \\ = & \neg \top \\ = & \perp && \text{use (4)} \\ = & \exists v: \text{null} \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: x \cdot b && \text{use (1)} \\ = & \neg \langle v: x \cdot b \rangle x && \text{this line is: } \neg(b \text{ but replace } v \text{ by } x) \\ = & \langle v: x \cdot \neg b \rangle x && \text{this line is: } (\neg b \text{ but replace } v \text{ by } x); \text{ now use (5)} \\ = & \exists v: x \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: A, B \cdot b && \text{use (2)} \\ = & \neg ((\forall v: A \cdot b) \wedge (\forall v: B \cdot b)) && \text{now apply the basic de Morgan} \\ = & \neg (\forall v: A \cdot b) \vee \neg (\forall v: B \cdot b) && \text{now a structural induction step, twice} \\ = & (\exists v: A \cdot \neg b) \vee (\exists v: B \cdot \neg b) && \text{use (6)} \\ = & \exists v: A, B \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \forall v: (\S v: E \cdot c) \cdot b && \text{use (3)} \\ = & \neg (\forall v: E \cdot c \Rightarrow b) && \text{now a structural induction step} \\ = & \exists v: E \cdot \neg(c \Rightarrow b) && \text{some binary algebra} \\ = & \exists v: E \cdot c \wedge \neg b && \text{use (7)} \\ = & \exists v: (\S v: E \cdot c) \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$

And the other duality law

$$\neg \exists v: D \cdot b = \forall v: D \cdot \neg b$$

can be proven similarly. Or we can prove it from the one we just proved.

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg \exists v: D \cdot b && \text{double negation} \\ = & \neg \exists v: D \cdot \neg \neg b && \text{use what we just proved} \\ = & \neg \neg \forall v: D \cdot \neg b && \text{double negation} \\ = & \forall v: D \cdot \neg b \end{aligned}$$