

- 4 Value tables and the Evaluation Rule can be replaced by some new axioms and anti-axioms. For example, one value table entry becomes the axiom $\top \vee \top$ and another becomes the axiom $\top \vee \perp$. These two axioms can be reduced to one axiom by the introduction of a variable, giving $\top \vee x$. Write the value tables as axioms and anti-axioms as succinctly as possible.

After trying the question, scroll down to the solution.

§ Writing the value tables as axioms and anti-axioms is easy: one axiom for each \top entry, and one anti-axiom for each \perp entry. However, in preparation for the next step, I'll use the Consistency Rule to write the anti-axioms as axioms by starting with a \neg sign. Here they are in order of their appearance on pages 3 and 4.

$\neg\neg\top$	$\perp \Rightarrow \top$	$\perp \neq \top$
$\neg\perp$	$\perp \Rightarrow \perp$	$\neg(\perp \neq \perp)$
$\top \wedge \top$	$\top \Leftarrow \top$	if \top then \top else \top fi
$\neg(\top \wedge \perp)$	$\top \Leftarrow \perp$	if \top then \top else \perp fi
$\neg(\perp \wedge \top)$	$\neg(\perp \Leftarrow \top)$	\neg if \top then \perp else \top fi
$\neg(\perp \wedge \perp)$	$\perp \Leftarrow \perp$	\neg if \top then \perp else \perp fi
$\top \vee \top$	$\top = \top$	if \perp then \top else \top fi
$\top \vee \perp$	$\neg(\top = \perp)$	\neg if \perp then \top else \perp fi
$\perp \vee \top$	$\neg(\perp = \top)$	if \perp then \perp else \top fi
$\neg(\perp \vee \perp)$	$\perp = \perp$	\neg if \perp then \perp else \perp fi
$\top \Rightarrow \top$	$\neg(\top \neq \top)$	
$\neg(\top \Rightarrow \perp)$	$\top \neq \perp$	

Now I use the Completion and Instance Rules to pair axioms that differ in only one position. An axiom can participate in more than one pairing.

$\neg\neg\top$	$x \Rightarrow \top$	$\neg(\perp = \top)$
$\neg\perp$	$\neg(\top \Rightarrow \perp)$	$\neg(x \neq x)$
$\top \wedge \top$	$\perp \Rightarrow x$	$\top \neq \perp$
$\neg(x \wedge \perp)$	$\top \Leftarrow x$	$\perp \neq \top$
$\neg(\perp \wedge x)$	$\neg(\perp \Leftarrow \top)$	if \top then \top else x fi
$\top \vee x$	$x \Leftarrow \perp$	\neg if \top then \perp else x fi
$x \vee \top$	$x = x$	if \perp then x else \top fi
$\neg(\perp \vee \perp)$	$\neg(\top = \perp)$	\neg if \perp then x else \perp fi

It may seem that we can use symmetry to make the list even shorter. But the symmetry laws are proven from these axioms, so we can't.