11. Question Answering and Textual Inference

Gerald Penn
Department of Computer Science, University of Toronto

(slides borrowed from Nate Chambers, Roxana Girju, Sanda Harabagiu, Chris Manning and Frank Rudzicz)
The common person’s view? [From a novel]

“I like the Internet. Really, I do. Any time I need a piece of shareware or I want to find out the weather in Bogota ... I’m the first guy to get the modem humming. But as a source of information, it sucks. You got a billion pieces of data, struggling to be heard and seen and downloaded, and anything I want to know seems to get trampled underfoot in the crowd.”


- An idea originating from the IR community
- With massive collections of full-text documents, simply finding *relevant documents* is of limited use: we want *answers* from textbases
- QA: give the user a (short) answer to their question, perhaps supported by evidence.
Question answering (QA)

• Question Answering (QA) usually involves a specific answer to a question.

Which woman has won more than 1 Nobel prize?

(Marie Curie)
Document retrieval vs IR

One strategy is to turn question answering into information retrieval (IR) and let the human complete the task.
Question answering (QA)

“Do I need an umbrella tomorrow in San Francisco?”

Yes, San Francisco should get rain tomorrow:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TUES</th>
<th>WED</th>
<th>THU</th>
<th>FRI</th>
<th>SAT</th>
<th>SUN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14°</td>
<td>16°</td>
<td>17°</td>
<td>17°</td>
<td>18°</td>
<td>18°</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Weekly Forecast

WolframAlpha

How much potassium is in 450,000 cubic kilometers of bananas?

Input interpretation:

| banana | amount | 450,000 km³ (cubic kilometers) | potassium |

Result:

$1.5 \times 10^{12}$ t (metric tons)
Knowledge-based QA

1. Build a **structured semantic representation** of the query.
   - Extract times, dates, locations, entities using **regular expressions**.
   - **Fit to well-known templates**.

2. Query databases with these semantics.
   - Ontologies (Wikipedia infoboxes).
   - Restaurant review databases.
   - Calendars.
   - Movie schedules.
   - ...
IR-based QA

Google

Where is the Louvre Museum located?

Search

About 904,000 results (0.30 seconds)

Everything

Best guess for Louvre Museum Location is Paris, France
Mentioned on at least 7 websites including wikipedia.org, answers.com and east-buc.k12.ia.us - Show sources - Feedback

Images

Maps

Musée du Louvre - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia
en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Musée_du_Louvre
Musée du Louvre is located in Paris. Location within Paris. Established, 1793. Location, Palais Royal, Musée du Louvre, 75001 Paris, France. Type, Art museum ...

Videos

News

Louvre Palace - List of works in the Louvre - Category:Musée du Louvre
IR-based QA

Information retrieval

Question answering
Sample TREC questions

1. Who is the author of the book, "The Iron Lady: A Biography of Margaret Thatcher"?
2. What was the monetary value of the Nobel Peace Prize in 1989?
3. What does the Peugeot company manufacture?
4. How much did Mercury spend on advertising in 1993?
5. What is the name of the managing director of Apricot Computer?
6. Why did David Koresh ask the FBI for a word processor?
7. What debts did Qintex group leave?
8. What is the name of the rare neurological disease with symptoms such as: involuntary movements (tics), swearing, and incoherent vocalizations (grunts, shouts, etc.)?
Query types

• Different kinds of questions can be asked.
  • Factoid questions, e.g.,
    • How often were the peace talks in Ireland delayed or disrupted as a result of acts of violence?
  • Narrative (open-ended) questions, e.g.,
    • Can you tell me about contemporary interest in the Greek philosophy of stoicism?
  • Complex/hybrid questions, e.g.,
    • Who was involved in the Schengen agreement to eliminate border controls in Western Europe and what did they hope to accomplish?
People *want* to ask questions…

Examples from AltaVista query log (late 1990s)
- who invented surf music?
- how to make stink bombs
- where are the snowdens of yesteryear?
- which english translation of the bible is used in official catholic liturgies?
- how to do clayart
- how to copy psx
- how tall is the sears tower?

Examples from Excite query log (12/1999)
- how can i find someone in texas
- where can i find information on puritan religion?
- what are the 7 wonders of the world
- how can i eliminate stress
- What vacuum cleaner does Consumers Guide recommend

Around 10% of early query logs
A Brief (Academic) History

- Question answering is not new

- Question answering systems can be found in many areas of NLP
  - Natural language database systems
    - A lot of early NLP work on these: e.g., LUNAR system
    - There’s still Microsoft English Query
  - Spoken dialog systems
    - Currently very active and commercially relevant
A Brief (Academic) History

- Focusing on open-domain QA is new focus
  - MURAX (Kupiec 1993): Encyclopedia answers
  - Hirschman: Reading comprehension tests
  - TREC QA competition: 1999–

- But not really new either: Simmons et al. 1965
  - Take an encyclopedia and load it onto a computer.
  - Take a question and parse it into a logical form
  - Perform simple information retrieval to get relevant texts, parse those into a logical form, match and rank
    - What do worms eat? Worms eat ???
      - Candidates
        - Worms eat grass
        - Grass is eaten by worms
        - Birds eat worms
Online QA Examples

- **LCC**: http://www.languagecomputer.com/demos/question_answering/index.html
- **AnswerBus** is an open-domain question answering system: www.answerbus.com
- **EasyAsk, AnswerLogic, AnswerFriend, Start, Quasm, Mulder, Webclopedia, ISI TextMap, etc.**
- **Google**
IBM’s Watson

source: A Brief Overview and Thoughts for Healthcare Education and Performance Improvement by the IBM Watson team
IBM’s Watson: search

This man became the 44th President of the United States in 2008
IBM’s Watson: search

- **Title-oriented search**: In some cases, the solution is in the title of highly-ranked documents.
  - *E.g.*, This pizza delivery boy celebrated New Year’s at Applied Cryogenics.
IBM’s Watson: selection

- Once **candidates** have been gathered from various **sources** and **methods**, rank them according to various scores (IBM Watson uses >50 scoring metrics).

  In cell division, mitosis splits the nucleus & cytokinesis splits **this liquid cushioning the nucleus**

“Cytoplasm is a **fluid surrounding** the nucleus…”

- Organelle
- Vacuole
- Cytoplasm
- Plasma
- Mitochondria
- Blood ...

Wordnet $\rightarrow$ Is_a(Fluid, Liquid) $\rightarrow$ ?

Learned $\rightarrow$ Is_a(Fluid, Liquid) $\rightarrow$ yes.

- $\text{Is(“Cytoplasm”, “liquid”) = 0.2}$
- $\text{Is(“organelle”, “liquid”) = 0.1}$
- $\text{Is(“vacuole”, “liquid”) = 0.2}$
- $\text{Is(“plasma”, “liquid”) = 0.7}$
IBM’s Watson: selection

- One aspect of *Jeopardy!* is that ‘answers’ are often posed with **puns** that have to be disambiguated.

> Bilbo shouldn’t have played riddles in the **dark** with this shady character

\[
sim(\text{shady,dark}) = 0.656 \\
sim(\text{dark,dishonest}) = 0.0
\]

*from WordNet’s Synonym-sets*
Question Answering at TREC

- Question answering competition at TREC consists of answering a set of 500 fact-based questions, e.g., “When was Mozart born?”.
- For the first three years systems were allowed to return 5 ranked answer snippets (50/250 bytes) to each question.
  - Mean Reciprocal Rank (MRR) scoring:
    - 1, 0.5, 0.33, 0.25, 0.2, 0 for 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6+ rankings
    - Mainly Named Entity answers (person, place, date, …)
- From 2002 the systems are only allowed to return a single exact answer and the notion of confidence has been introduced.
The current collection uses news articles from the following sources:
- AP newswire, 1998-2000
- Xinhua News Agency newswire, 1996-2000
In total there are 1,033,461 documents in the collection. 3GB of text.
This is a lot of text to process entirely using advanced NLP techniques so the systems usually consist of an initial information retrieval phase followed by more advanced processing.
Many supplement this text with use of the web, and other knowledge bases
Top Performing Systems

- Best TREC systems answer ~70% of the questions !!!
- Approaches and successes have varied a fair deal
  - Knowledge-rich approaches, using a vast array of NLP techniques have been most successful
    - Notably Harabagiu, Moldovan et al. – SMU/UTD/LCC
  - AskMSR stressed how much could be achieved by very simple methods with enough text (and now various copycats)
AskMSR: Shallow approach

- In what year did Abraham Lincoln die?
- Ignore hard documents and find easy ones

Abraham Lincoln, 1809-1865

*LINCOLN, ABRAHAM* was born near Hodgenville, Kentucky, on February 12, 1809. In 1816, the Lincoln family moved to Pigeon Creek in Perry (now Spencer) County. Two years later, Abraham Lincoln's mother died and his father married a woman named secondly his "angel" mother. Lincoln attended formal school for only a few months but acquired knowledge through the reading of books. When he was 18, he was hired as a store clerk and the local postmaster. He served without distinction as the Black Hawk War hero and lost his attempt at state legislature, but two years later he tried again, was successful, and was re-elected. Lincoln was admitted to the bar and became noteworthy as a witty, honest, competent county judge. He was re-elected to the U.S. House in 1846, at which time he opposed the war with Mexico. By 1854, the question of slavery in Kansas was drawing national attention for his series of debates with Stephen A. Douglas. Lincoln won the election in 1858, and shortly after the election he became a significant figure in his party.

On March 4, 1861, Lincoln was inaugurated president. Twelve of the 11 southern states had already seceded from the Union by the time he took office; they would eventually secede, for a total of 11. Lincoln immediately took action to raise an army and uphold the U.S. Constitution and laws. The Emancipation Proclamation, which expanded the purpose of the Civil War from preserving the Union to ending slavery, was enacted on January 1, 1863. Lincoln was assassinated by John Wilkes Booth while attending a theatrical performance in Ford's Theatre on April 14, 1865.

Abraham Lincoln

16th President of the United States (March 4, 1861 to April 15, 1865)

Born: February 12, 1809, in Hardin County, Kentucky
Died: April 15, 1865, at Petersen's Boarding House in Washington, D.C.

"I was born February 12, 1809, in Hardin County, Kentucky. My parents were both born in Virginia, of undistinguished families, perhaps I should say. My mother, who died in my tenth year, was of a family of the name of Hanks..."
AskMSR: Details

1. Rewrite Query
2. <Search Engine>
3. Collect Summaries, Mine N-grams
4. Filter N-Grams
5. Tile N-Grams

Question: Where is the Louvre Museum located?

in Paris France 59% museums 12% hostels 10%

N-Best Answers
Query rewriting: Answer similar to Question

- Classify question into seven categories
  - **Who** is/was/are/were...?
  - **When** is/did/will/are/were ...?
  - **Where** is/are/were ...

  a. Category-specific transformation rules
     "Where is the Louvre Museum located"
     → "is the Louvre Museum located"
     → "the is Louvre Museum located"
     → "the Louvre is Museum located"
     → "the Louvre Museum is located"
     → "the Louvre Museum located is"

  b. Expected answer “Datatype” (eg, Date, Person, Location)
     **When** was the French Revolution? → DATE

  c. Hand-crafted classification/rewrite/datatype rules
     - Can they be learned?

Nonsense, but who cares? It’s only a few more queries to Google.
Mining N-Grams

- Send query to search engine; use result snippets
- Enumerate all N-grams in all retrieved snippets
  - Use hash table and other fancy footwork to make this efficient
- Weight of an n-gram: occurrence count, each weighted by “reliability” (weight) of rewrite that fetched the document
- Example: “Who created the character of Scrooge?”
  - Dickens - 117
  - Christmas Carol - 78
  - Charles Dickens - 75
  - Disney - 72
  - Carl Banks - 54
  - A Christmas - 41
  - Christmas Carol - 45
  - Uncle - 31
Filtering N-Grams

- Each question type is associated with one or more "data-type filters" = regular expression
- When… ➔ Date
- Where… ➔ Location
- What … ➔ Location
- Who … ➔ Person
- Boost score of n-grams that do match regexp
- Lower score of n-grams that don’t match regexp
Step 5: Tiling the Answers

Scores

20  Charles  Dickens
15  Dickens
10  Mr Charles

merged, discard old n-grams

Score 45  Mr Charles  Dickens

N-Grams

tile highest-scoring n-gram

Repeat, until no more overlap
Results

- Standard TREC contest test-bed:
  ~1M documents; 900 questions
- Doesn’t do so well (but in top 9 of ~30 participants!)
  - MRR = 0.262
    - Right answer ranked about #4–5 on average
  - Why? Because it relies on the enormity of the Web!
- Using the Web as a whole, not just TREC’s 1M documents
  - MRR = 0.42
    - On average, right answer is ranked about #2–3
Limitations

- In many scenarios we only have a small set of documents
  - e.g., monitoring an individuals email...
- Works best/only for “Trivial Pursuit”-style fact-based questions
- Limited/brittle repertoire of
  - question categories
  - answer data types/filters
  - query rewriting rules
Full NLP QA: LCC (Harabagiu/Moldovan)
[below is the Architecture of LCC’s QA system circa 2003]
Value from sophisticated NLP
Pasca and Harabagiu (2001)

- Good IR is needed: SMART paragraph retrieval
- Large taxonomy of question types and expected answer types is crucial
- Statistical parser used to parse questions and relevant text for answers, and to build KB
- Further value comes from deeper NLP and inferencing
Answer types in State-of-the-art QA systems

Features

Answer type

- Labels questions with answer type based on a taxonomy
  - Person, location, weight, temperature, year, vehicle
- Classifies questions (e.g. by using a maximum entropy model)
Answer Types

- Of course, determining the answer type isn’t that easy…
  - **Who** questions can have organizations as answers
    - Who sells the most hybrid cars?
  - **Which** questions can have people as answers
    - Which president went to war with Mexico?
Lexical Terms Extraction: Input to Information Retrieval

- Questions approximated by sets of unrelated words (lexical terms)
- Similar to bag-of-word IR models: but choose nominal non-stop words and verbs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question (from TREC QA track)</th>
<th>Lexical terms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q002: What was the monetary value of the Nobel Peace Prize in 1989?</td>
<td>monetary, value, Nobel, Peace, Prize, 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q003: What does the Peugeot company manufacture?</td>
<td>Peugeot, company, manufacture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q004: How much did Mercury spend on advertising in 1993?</td>
<td>Mercury, spend, advertising, 1993</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Keyword Selection Algorithm

1. Select all non-stopwords in quotations
2. Select all NNP words in recognized named entities
3. Select all complex nominals with their adjectival modifiers
4. Select all other complex nominals
5. Select all nouns with adjectival modifiers
6. Select all other nouns
7. Select all verbs
8. Select the answer type word
Passage Extraction Loop

- **Passage Extraction Component**
  - Extracts passages that contain all selected keywords
  - Passage size dynamic
  - Start position dynamic

- **Passage quality and keyword adjustment**
  - In the first iteration use the first 6 keyword selection heuristics
  - If the number of passages is lower than a threshold ⇒ query is too strict ⇒ drop a keyword
  - If the number of passages is higher than a threshold ⇒ query is too relaxed ⇒ add a keyword
Passage Scoring

- Passage ordering is performed using a sort that involves three scores:
  - The number of words from the question that are recognized in the same sequence in the window
  - The number of words that separate the most distant keywords in the window
  - The number of unmatched keywords in the window
Q066: Name the first private citizen to fly in space.

- **Answer type:** Person
- **Text passage:**
  
  “Among them was Christa McAuliffe, the first private citizen to fly in space. Karen Allen, best known for her starring role in “Raiders of the Lost Ark”, plays McAuliffe. Brian Kerwin is featured as shuttle pilot Mike Smith...”

- **Best candidate answer:** Christa McAuliffe
In TREC 2003 the LCC QA system extracted 289 correct answers for factoid questions.

The Name Entity Recognizer was responsible for 234 of them.

Current QA is largely based on the high accuracy recognition of a large variety of Named Entity types.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>QUANTITY</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUMBER</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DATE</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERSON</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COUNTRY</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER LOCATIONS</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITY</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORGANIZATION</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUTHORED WORK</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRODUCT</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTINENT</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROVINCE</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUOTE</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRICE</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCIENCE NAME</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACRONYM</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDRESS</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALPHABET</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URI</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Semantics and Reasoning for QA: Predicate-argument structure

- **Q336**: *When was Microsoft established?*
- This question is **difficult** because Microsoft tends to establish lots of things...

  *Microsoft plans to establish manufacturing partnerships in Brazil and Mexico in May.*

- Need to be able to detect sentences in which ‘Microsoft’ is **object** of ‘establish’ or close synonym.

- Matching sentence:

  *Microsoft Corp was founded in the US in 1975, incorporated in 1981, and established in the UK in 1982.*

- Requires analysis of sentence syntax/semantics!
Semantics and Reasoning for QA: Syntax to Logical Forms

- Syntactic analysis plus semantic \(\Rightarrow\) logical form
- Mapping of question and potential answer LFs to find the best match
Abductive inference

- System attempts inference to justify an answer (often following lexical chains)
- Their inference is a kind of funny middle ground between logic and pattern matching
- But very effective: 30% improvement
  - Q: When was the internal combustion engine invented?
  - A: The first internal-combustion engine was built in 1867.
  - invent → create_mentally → create → build
Question Answering Example

**Q:** How hot does the inside of an active volcano get?

- `get(TEMPERATURE, inside(volcano(active)))`

**A:** “lava fragments belched out of the mountain were as hot as 300 degrees Fahrenheit”

- `fragments(X, lava, temperature(degrees(300)), belched(X, mountain))`
- `volcano ISA mountain`
- `lava ISPARTOF volcano`
- `lava inside volcano`
- `fragments of lava HAVEPROPERTIESOF lava`

- The needed semantic information is in WordNet definitions, and was successfully translated into a form that was used for rough ‘proofs’
Answer Validation motivates the Robust Textual Inference Task

- The task: Can systems correctly perform ‘local textual inferences’ [individual inference steps]?
- On the assumption that some piece of text (T) is true, does this imply the truth of some other hypothesis text (H)?
  - *Sydney was the host city of the 2000 Olympics* →
  - *The Olympics have been held in Sydney* \(\text{TRUE}\)
- The format could be used for evaluating extended inferential chains or knowledge
  - But, in practice, fairly direct stuff
The textual inference task

- Does text $T$ justify an inference to hypothesis $H$?
  - Emphasis on variability of linguistic expression
- Robust, accurate textual inference would enable:
  - Semantic search: H: *lobbyists attempting to bribe U.S. legislators*
    T: *The A.P. named two more senators who received contributions engineered by lobbyist Jack Abramoff in return for political favors.*
  - Question answering: H: *Who bought J.D. Edwards?*
    T: *Thanks to its recent acquisition of J.D. Edwards, Oracle will soon be able...*
  - Customer email response
  - Relation extraction (database building)
  - Document summarization
Natural Examples: Reading Comprehension

(CNN Student News) -- January 24, 2006

Answer the following questions about today's featured news stories. Write your answers in the space provided.

1. Where is the country of Somalia located? What ocean borders this country?

2. Why did crew members from the USS Winston S. Churchill recently stop a small vessel off the coast of Somalia? What action did the crew of the Churchill take?
Verification of terms

Non-disclosure Agreement

WHEREAS Recipient is desirous of obtaining said confidential information for purposes of evaluation thereof and as a basis for further discussions with Owner regarding assistance with development of the confidential information for the benefit of Owner or for the mutual benefit of Owner and Recipient;

THEREFORE, Recipient hereby agrees to receive the information in confidence and to treat it as confidential for all purposes. Recipient will not divulge or use in any manner any of said confidential information unless by written consent from Owner, and Recipient will use at least the same efforts it regularly employs for its own confidential information to avoid disclosure to others.

Provided, however, that this obligation to treat information confidentially will not apply to any information already in Recipient’s possession or to any information that is generally available to the public or becomes generally available through no act or influence of Recipient. Recipient will inform Owner of the public nature or Recipient’s possession of the information without delay after Owner’s disclosure thereof or will be stopped from asserting such as defense to remedy under this agreement.

Each party acknowledges that all of the disclosing party’s Confidential Information is owned solely by the disclosing party (or its licensors and/or other vendors) and that the unauthorized disclosure or use of such Confidential Information would cause irreparable harm and significant injury, the degree of which may be difficult to ascertain. Accordingly, each party agrees that the disclosing party will have the right to obtain an immediate injunction enjoining any breach of this Agreement, as well as the right to pursue any and all other rights and remedies available at law or in equity for such a breach.

Recipient will exercise its best efforts to conduct its evaluation within a reasonable time after Owner’s disclosure and will provide Owner with its assessment thereof without delay. Recipient will return all information, including all copies thereof, to Owner upon request. This agreement shall remain in effect for ten years after the date of its execution, and it shall be construed under the laws of the State of Texas.

Conditions I care about:

- All information discussed is freely shareable unless other party indicates in advance that it is confidential

  TRUE?  FALSE?
Stanford three-stage architecture
[MacCartney et al. 2006]

T: *India buys missiles.*  $\models$

H: *India acquires arms.*

1. **linguistic analysis**

   buys
     
     \[ nsubj \]
     \[ India \]
     \[ \]  
     \[ dobj \]
     \[ missiles \]

   acquires
     
     \[ nsubj \]
     \[ India \]
     \[ \]  
     \[ dobj \]
     \[ arms \]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>POS</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>IDF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td></td>
<td>NNP</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buys</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **graph alignment**

   buys
     
     \[ nsubj \]
     \[ India \]
     \[ \]  
     \[ dobj \]
     \[ missiles \]

   acquires
     
     \[ nsubj \]
     \[ India \]
     \[ \]  
     \[ dobj \]
     \[ arms \]

\[ -0.53 \]  
\[ -0.75 \]  
\[ -1.28 \]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>POS</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>IDF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td></td>
<td>NNP</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buys</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. **features & classification**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>$f_i$</th>
<th>$w_i$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Structure match</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alignment: good</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ \text{score} = \sum_i w_i f_i = -0.88 \]

tuned threshold

yes

no
Textual inference as graph alignment

[Haghighi et al. 05, de Salvo Braz et al. 05]

- Find least cost alignment of H to part of T, using locally decomposable cost model (lexical and structural costs)
- Assumption: good alignment $\Rightarrow$ valid inference

T: **CNN reported that thirteen soldiers lost their lives in today’s ambush.**

H: **Several troops were killed in the ambush.**
Problem: graph embedding isn’t sufficient

- To be tractable, alignment scoring must be local
- But valid inference can hinge on non-local factors:

T1: \( GM \) acknowledged that accounting deficiencies had led to errors.
H: \( Accounting \) deficiencies led to errors.

T2: Newsweek retracted its report that \( GM \) acknowledged that accounting deficiencies had led to errors.
H: \( Accounting \) deficiencies led to errors
Features of valid inferences

- After alignment, extract features of inference
  - Look for *global* characteristics of valid and invalid inferences
  - Features embody crude semantic theories
  - Feature categories: *adjuncts*, modals, quantifiers, *implicatives*, antonymy, tenses, structure, explicit numbers & dates
  - Alignment score is also an important feature
- Extracted features $\Rightarrow$ statistical model $\Rightarrow$ score
  - Can learn feature weights using logistic regression
  - Or, can use hand-tuned weights
- ($\text{Score} \geq \text{threshold}$)? $\Rightarrow$ prediction: yes/no
  - Threshold can be tuned
Structural (mis-)match features

T: Ahmadinejad attacked the “threat” to bring the issue of Iran’s nuclear activity to the UN Security Council by the US, France, Britain and Germany.

H: Ahmadinejad attacked the UN Security Council. (FALSE)

- Check the main predicate of the hypothesis and its match in the text to assess compatibility using syntactic grammatical relations:
  - Object of attack in hypothesis is not related to object of attack in text
Factives & other implicatives

T: Libya *has tried*, with limited success, to *develop* its own indigenous missile, and to extend the range of its aging SCUD force for many years under the Al Fatah and other missile programs.

H: Libya has *developed* its own domestic missile program. (FALSE)

T: Scientists *have discovered* that drinking tea *protects against* heart disease by improving the function of the artery walls.

H: Tea protects from some disease. (TRUE)

- Evaluate governing verbs for implicativity
  - Unknown: *say, tell, suspect, try, …*
  - Fact: *know, wonderful, …*
  - True: *manage to, …*
  - False: *doubtful, misbelieve, …*
- Need to check for negative context
Restrictive adjuncts

- We can check whether adding/dropping restrictive adjuncts is licensed relative to upward and downward entailing contexts

- In all, Zerich bought $422 million worth of oil from Iraq, according to the Volcker committee
- $\not= Zerich$ bought oil from Iraq *during the embargo*

- Zerich didn’t buy any oil from Iraq, according to the Volcker committee
- $\not= Zerich$ didn’t buy oil from Iraq *during the embargo*
QA beyond TREC

- Answers to complex questions that require a longer answer
  - *What is a PIC Freeze?*
  - *Can I travel with Ameripass in Mexico?*
- Soricut and Brill 2006
  - Use the web (real FAQ websites)
- Otterbacher *et al.* 2005
  - Random walk model similar to PageRank
- Daume and Marcu 2006
  - Formal model for query expansion
Not all problems are solved yet!

- Where do lobsters like to live?
  - on a Canadian airline

- Where are zebras most likely found?
  - near dumps
  - in the dictionary

- Why can't ostriches fly?
  - Because of American economic sanctions

- What’s the population of Mexico?
  - Three

- What can trigger an allergic reaction?
  - ..something that can *trigger* an allergic reaction
References


H. Daume and D. Marcu. *Bayesian Query-Focused Summarization*. ACL 2006
